Management of diversity in Peruvian companies: The cases of IBM, Atento and Scotiabank

Gestión de la diversidad en empresas peruanas: los casos de IBM, Atento y Scotiabank

Isabel Gastelú Ledesma
Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú, Lima, Perú
igastelu@pucp.pe

Paloma Martinez - Hague
Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú, Lima, Perú
pmartinezh@pucp.pe

Fecha de recepción: 13 de julio de 2020
Fecha de aprobación: 2 de febrero de 2021
Fecha de publicación: 4 de setiembre de 2021

1. This research is based upon the dissertation of one of the authors (Alarcon, Castillo & Gastelú, 2018).
The management of diversity is important today, as proven by the varied research available on this topic. However, when we wanted to understand the management of LGBT diversity, we found little research worldwide, let alone in Latin America. We found a measurement model in the region developed by the Ethos Institute of Brazil which allowed us to understand the current situation of LGBT diversity management in three companies in Peru. Since Peru and Brazil are both Latin American countries, one could think that the model is international and transversal to both realities. However, our research proposed an adaptation of the model to simplify it because elements found in Brazil were not yet present in Peruvian companies. This qualitative investigation applies the adapted and contextualized instrument to three large companies in Peru and presents a rather unique and interesting view of LGBT diversity management.

**Palabras clave:** Diversity management, LGBT, measurement model

Actualmente somos conscientes de la importancia de gestionar la diversidad en las empresas, y encontramos variedad de investigaciones al respecto. Sin embargo, cuando quisimos comprender la gestión de la diversidad LGBT, encontramos poca investigación en todo el mundo, y mucho menos en América Latina. Encontramos un modelo de medición en la región desarrollado por el Instituto Ethos de Brasil, que nos permitió comprender la situación actual de la gestión de la diversidad LGBT en tres empresas del Perú. Al ser dos países latinoamericanos, se puede pensar que el modelo es internacional y transversal a ambas realidades. Sin embargo, nuestra investigación propuso una adaptación del modelo para simplificarlo porque los elementos en Brasil aún no estaban presentes en las empresas peruanas. Esta investigación cualitativa aplica el instrumento adaptado y contextualizado a tres grandes empresas en Perú y presenta una visión bastante singular e interesante de la gestión de la diversidad LGBT.

**Keywords:** Gestión de la diversidad, LGBT, modelo de medición
1. Introduction

To be more competitive in a very changing and vertiginous context, companies must ensure diversity. Diversity is the collection of many individual differences and similarities that exist between people. In business, it is an essential component for growth, innovation, job satisfaction, commitment, better performance and sustainability. This is why the management that deals with including diversity and capitalizing on it, better known as diversity management, has become more prominent in recent years (Badgett et al., 2013; Kreitner & Knicki, 2001; Instituto Ethos, 2014; Hunt et al., 2015; Mor Barak et al., 2016; REDI, 2016; Turek, 2017).

The range of types of diversity to be managed by companies is vast, so not all of them are managed in the same way. One example of this is the management of diversity by sexual orientation and gender identity, which is still under development (Bailinson et al., 2020; Carcedo Cabañas et al., 2016; Instituto Ethos, 2014). One of the most vulnerable diversities not only in society but in the workplace is the group consisting of lesbians\(^1\), gays\(^2\), bisexuals\(^3\), and transgender people\(^4\) (LGBT) (Köllen, 2016; Ozeren, 2014). There is data from the United States reporting that at least “one in five LGBT people experience discrimination because of their sexuality or gender identity when applying for jobs (20 %), when being paid equally or considered for promotion (22 %)” (Dwyer, 2017). However, in Latin America and specifically in Peru, there is no apparent data about the subject (Gómez, 2019).

In Peru, LGBTs are one of the social groups that have least political representation (Jurado Nacional de Elecciones, 2016). These groups, being vulnerable in society, are also vulnerable in the workplace (Defensoría del Pueblo, 2016). However, there is little official, specific, and detailed information that allows us to know the situation of the LGBT population, and much less in the workplace. A reflection of this situation is the reduced number of academic publications related to the subject.

Motivated by this situation, we searched for models that could allow the understanding of LGBT diversity management in Peruvian companies. According to one of the experts interviewed and research, the latent vulnerability of this human group causes a lack of models for its study (Gómez, 2019). However, the Ethos Institute\(^5\) has presented its diagnostic model called the “Business Commitment to LGBT Human Rights - Guidance to the Business World in Actions Aimed at Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Transvestite and Transgender People”, in which they establish 10 commitments for the promotion of rights of LGBTs in companies, becoming one of the few models found and developed for the Latin American reality (Forbes, 2016; OIT, 2015).

---

1 It is understood as the sexual, erotic, emotional and affective desire of a woman towards another woman (OIT, 2016).
2 Sexual, erotic, emotional and affective desire of a man towards another man (OIT, 2016).
3 It refers to the ability of a person to feel a deep emotional, affective, and sexual attraction for people of a gender other than their own, and of the same gender, as well as the ability to maintain intimate and sexual relationships with these people (CIDH, n.d.).
4 Non-conforming people between their biological sex and gender identity that has traditionally been assigned to it, which has no relation to their sexual orientation, which may be heterosexual, homosexual or bisexual (CIDH, n.d.).
5 The Ethos Institute of Business and Social Responsibility is a civil organization of public interest in Brazil. It was created in 1998. Its mission is to mobilize, sensitize, and help companies to manage their businesses in a socially responsible way, making them associated with the construction of a fair and sustainable society (Instituto Ethos, 2016).
The general objective of the research was to describe the current status of LGBT diversity management in companies in Lima, Peru recognized as people oriented by national rankings such as Aequales\textsuperscript{6}, Great Place to Work (GPTW)\textsuperscript{7} and Merco Talento\textsuperscript{8} between 2014 and 2016.

One of the most relevant findings was that five of the Ethos Institute (2014) commitments were not relevant to study, according to the validation of experts, because the management of LGBT diversity in Peru is not yet prepared to measure them. Another finding was that the participating companies that met the required profile were all international and received guidelines regarding the management of diversity from their parent companies in the United States, Canada and Spain. In the research process two variables not contemplated by the Ethos diagnostic model emerged; these are the impact of national culture and the organizational value of respect on LGBT diversity management.

The structure of this article is as follows. First, we review the literature related to the subject of study in the next section. Then, the variables to be analysed are identified, followed by their description. The article culminates with a discussion about our findings and conclusions about the research.

2. Literature review

2.1. Diversity management and LGBT

Diversity management not only adds value to a company. Most importantly it applies a justice approach aimed at reducing systemic injustice and economic exploitation in order to transform the workplace into an environment of healthy and productive relationships (Cross, 2010). A definition which integrates these views is that proposed by the Ethos Institute (2014), recognizing diversity management as the consideration of singularities and the promotion of respect for human rights. Within this definition, managing diversity means managing people, because where there are people, there is diversity; and the objective of this management is to convert the richness of human diversity into an added value for people, businesses and society. It also promotes interactions, meetings, exchanging of perspectives, expectations and knowledge in an environment full of cooperation and good performance. This definition will guide the research.

The European Institute for Diversity Management (IEGD, n.d.) divides diversity into visible and invisible. Likewise, it considers that non-visible diversities such as sexual diversity are the ones that generate the most conflicts in organizations, resulting in the deterioration of efficiency and responsible for an increase in operational and structural costs. Besides, if not appropriately managed, it results in increased conflict, lack of cooperation which converts into a lack of retention, reduces innovation and creativity, could generate

\textsuperscript{6} The Gender Equity in Organizations ranking, promoted by Aequales and the International Organization of Women in Business (OWIT), lists companies according to the level of development of their diversity management in the field of gender diversity.

\textsuperscript{7} The ranking was chosen because of its reputation.

\textsuperscript{8} The ranking was selected because the presence of a company in this ranking shows that it is recognized and valued by the labour market.
loss of revenue, and could even jeopardize the sustainability of the company (IEGD, n.d.; Mor Barak et al., 2016).

The term “sexual diversity” refers to the different orientations that each person may have concerning their sexual identity and affectivity (Fundación CEPAIM, 2016). Therefore, the Ethos Institute (2014) considers that the term “sexual diversity” is too broad since it refers to different sexual orientations and gender identities. That is why the use of the term “sexual diversity” should be contextualized with a focus on the LGBT segment, thus allowing the delimitation and a better understanding of the issues and rights addressed. (Instituto Ethos, 2014).

Unlike the others, this type of diversity is a hidden stigma, and because of this, individuals often decide to hide or not reveal their orientation or identity (Badgett et al., 2013; Bailinson et al., 2020; O’ Mahoney, 2014; OIT, 2015). Therefore, LGBT diversity management is understood as a set of processes focused on the company committing to the management of the sexual diversity variable through the implementation and improvement of action plans. It implies considering that people have the right to develop their identity in freedom, to build their world of affections, and to be able to enjoy it (Fundación CEPAIM, 2016; OIT, 2015). It is not enough to “include” and “allow” the expression of LGBT people; it is also necessary to promote respectful and potentially creative and innovative interactions around the essence of the company, its purpose, and its strategies (Instituto Ethos, 2014).

2.2. Ethos diagnostic model

In their meta-analysis of workplace policies for the LGBT community, Badgett et al. (2013) identify as a limitation the fact that most studies used “convenience samples of predominantly white, well-educated, self-identified sexual minorities recruited through connections with the LGBT community” (p. 23) that were obtained mainly in the United States. As mentioned before, the 10 Business Commitments for the Promotion of LGBTI Rights designed by Txai Consulting & Education in association with the Ethos Institute provide a rare opportunity to use a diagnostic model developed within a Latin American approach and recognized by the United Nations (OIT, 2015). Even more, the model has been used to evaluate companies from the Business and Rights Forum LGBT⁹ in Brazil.

According to OIT (2015),

These commitments are the result of the actions of the movements social issues and their demands on the world of work, especially those expressed in the country’s government plans [...] and in the Reports on Homophobic Violence in Brazil [...] They are based on Convention 111 of the ILO (Discrimination in Matters of Employment and Occupation) (pp. 72-73).

These commitments intend to create an agenda of practical actions that express legitimate social claims, international human rights standards, expectations of the corporate

⁹ Information about the forum and its associated companies can be found in https://www.forumempresaslgbt.com/
social responsibility movement, and discussions about current practices in some companies in Brazil. Also, they offer parameters, indicators of actions, and indicators of depth, which allow the company to make a diagnosis of the situation and the actions in order to maintain, improve or create practices to promote LGBT rights. We used the indicators of actions to measure the Ethos model commitments (Instituto Ethos, 2014).

The 10 Commitments are:

1. Commit –CEO and executives– to respecting and promoting LGBT rights.
2. Promote equal opportunities and fair treatment for LGBT people.
3. Promote a respectful, safe, and healthy environment for LGBT people.
4. Sensitize to and educate on LGBT rights.
5. Encourage and support the creation of LGBT affinity groups.
6. Promote respect for LGBT rights in communication and marketing.
7. Promote respect for LGBT rights in planning products, services, and customer service.
8. Promote professional development actions for people of the LGBT segment.
9. Promote the economic and social development of LGBT people in the value chain.

3. Methodology

The qualitative approach provides depth, dispersion, interpretative richness, contextualization of the environment or surroundings, details and unique experiences to the data. It also provides a fresh, natural and complete point of view of the phenomena, as well as flexibility (Hernandez et al., 2010). This approach is the most appropriate for this study, since the topic of LGBT diversity management in Peru and Latin America is scarce and we do not intend to generalize the findings in a probabilistic way, but understand, in depth, the commitment and actions of the companies in relation to said topic. In order to know about LGBT diversity management in Peru, and the similarities and differences in the policies and practices applied there, this investigation focuses on companies found in said country. Also, we used case study as a general research strategy; this is a single, embedded case study (Stake, 2000). We collected the data in 2017 and carried out a methodological triangulation of information among the professionals responsible for LGBT diversity management in the case studies, LGBT and non-LGBT collaborators in the case studies, and secondary information from the companies (Jack & Raturi, 2006). Figure 1 shows the design of the methodology.

The first step of the research was to validate and adapt the Ethos Institute diagnostic instrument to the reality of companies in Peru in order to identify the variables to study. Because this is a relatively new topic, it was necessary to collect perspectives from experts on the topic. The objective was to obtain a more significant approximation to the subject in the Peruvian context, which allowed improving the problem’s approach and
validating the defined methodological tools, as well as selecting the research variables. For the sampling, we used a mixed strategy: convenience sampling and chain sampling. First, we developed a list of people with extensive experience and recognized issues related to LGBT rights in the workplace. Then, we invited those to whom we had access to an in-depth interview. After the interview, the experts suggested other experts on the subject. We conducted four in-depth interviews with experts recognized as opinion leaders on the subject, after which we found saturation:

1. The former president of the MHOL (Homosexual Movement of Lima) and researcher of an interdisciplinary research centre on sexuality, AIDS and society.
2. The director of the NGO Presente, an activist for LGBT rights and business consultant on LGBT diversity issues for companies in Peru.
3. A professional from the Peruvian ombudsman organization, within the human rights and people with disabilities office, collaborator of reports on the reality of the LGBT population in Peru.
4. A specialized lawyer on gender issues, former coordinator of the Aequales ranking in Peru.

In the next step, we identified the companies that became the case studies. The case studies had to meet the following characteristics:

1. Be located in Lima, the capital of the country.
2. Have more than 100 workers.
3. Have specific policies and positions on diversity.
4. Have a presence in the rankings of diversity and human resources management from 2014 to 2016, such as the Gender Equity in Organization’s ranking, promoted by Aequales; the International Organization of Women in Business (OWIT); the Great Place to Work (GPTW); or Merco Talent.
The three companies chosen were IBM\(^\text{10}\), Atento\(^\text{11}\) and Scotiabank\(^\text{12}\), because they met all the criteria and are referents of diversity management. Notwithstanding the choice of a qualitative study in order to draw inferences from similarities or differences between these chosen companies (Stake, 2000), each of them is in a different sector. As a result, the profile of their employees is not similar. The three companies gave their consent to participate and be identified for the study.

The third step of the research process was to measure the LGBT diversity management in the three companies with the adapted diagnostic model of the Ethos Institute. We did this by reviewing secondary information from the companies, interviews with those responsible for managing LGBT diversity and both LGBT and non-LGBT collaborators. Before beginning with the interviews, we tested the interview guides as a pilot study with a human resources manager from a company in Peru, as well as a human resources and diversity consultant; with their feedback, we improved the guide. However, as Hernandez \emph{et al.} (2010) propose, qualitative research is a spiral process between collecting and analysing information, as it was in the study.

The secondary information reviewed were internal (internal regulations, code of ethics) and external business documents (annual report, Sustainability Report or Social Responsibility); as well as the official web pages and social networks; and news related to the management of LGBT diversity. Based on this information, it was possible to have a knowledge base about the policies and practices the company applied. It allowed us to attend the interviews with specific information on the subject.

In the interviews with the managers and collaborators, we sought to know about the policies and practices related to LGBT diversity management that they perceive in the company in order to subsequently assess the current state of diversity management using as a basis the adapted Ethos Institute diagnostic model. Subsequently, we interviewed LGBT and non-LGBT collaborators from the case studies.

This is how we were able to use methodological triangulation. For this research, we used more than one qualitative data source; we interviewed seven people in charge of LGBT diversity management, 16 collaborators of the companies studied, and reviewed documents about the three studied companies (Jick, 1979; Jack & Raturi, 2006).

---

\(^{10}\) International Business Machines Corporation (IBM) is a technology company, founded in 1914 in the United States. It currently operates in 170 countries and has more than 386,000 employees across the globe. IBM has had an uninterrupted presence in Peru since 1932, currently registering sales for more than 857,291 million soles and employing approximately 1,836 workers, of which only 29% are women (GPTW, 2017; IBM, 2014; IBM, 2017).

\(^{11}\) Atento is the leading company in BPO (Business Process Outsourcing) and CEM (Customer Experience Management) in Latin America and Spain. It is present in 13 countries around the world, with its headquarters being located in Madrid, Spain. It has a total of 95 service centres, 90 thousand positions, and more than 150,000 employees. With more than 400 clients around three continents, it is the undisputed leader in Latin America with an 18.3% market share in the region by 2015. In Peru, it began operations in 1999, and today they are the most recognized company in the call-center sector, with three contact centres distributed in their Molina, Callao and Trujillo campuses. They are employing 9,200 service positions according to the 2016 Annual Attention Report and 14,961 employees by the end of 2017. Revenues at the end of 2014 amounted to USD 151.8 millions according to the Annual Report of 2016 (Atento, n.d.; Atento, 2016; Frost & Sullivan, 2015; GPTW, 2017).

\(^{12}\) Scotiabank Peru is a Canadian capital company that acts as a subsidiary of Bank of Nova Scotia (BNS). It has a presence in more than 15 countries around the world, with its headquarters being located in Canada. It is the third bank in the Peruvian credit sector, owning 15% of the market. It began operations in Peru in 2006 and represents an income of 4,739 million soles and an approximate of 671 thousand customers. In Peru, it has 5,772 workers out of which 54% are women, and only 37% of them have managerial positions (Apoyo & Asociados, 2017; BVL, 2017; SMV, 2017).
We organized the qualitative information according to the collection tool used and the information source. We worked with a two-level manual coding process in which the variables were established a priori based on the research objectives and adapted from the Ethos Institute diagnostic model based on the experts’ criteria.

However, in the first level coding process, some new variables emerged. To ensure objectivity in the process, the person in charge of the codification was different from the one who conducted the interview. In the second level of coding, all of the variables were grouped by theme. Finally, with the data organized in matrices, we proceeded to compare the case studies in regard to each specific variable, including the new ones identified for this study, looking for similarities and differences between them (Aurini et al., 2016; Given, 2008; Hernandez et al., 2010).

3.1. The Ethos diagnostic model adapted to the Peruvian reality

Through interviews and using a measurement scale, we asked experts to assign a degree of importance from 1 (unimportant) to 3 (very important) to each of the 10 commitments presented by the Ethos diagnostic model (Appendix A), considering its use in the Peruvian context, resulting in a diagnostic model that includes the five most relevant variables presented below (Appendix B).

This external validation of the variables to be studied in this research by the experts makes it possible for us to design the interviews with those responsible for managing LGBT diversity and with LGBT and non-LGBT collaborators. We based the interview questions upon the indicator actions for each commitment (Yin, 2018).

1. The commitment of the CEO and executives to respect and promote LGBT rights: The literature on diversity management cites leadership, more frequently than any other, as an element of an effective diversity strategy (Marquis et al., 2008), evidencing that it is critical in LGBT diversity management. In line with this, the Ethos Institute (2014) decided to establish as the first commitment that the presidency and executives (senior management) respect and promote LGBT rights. It also suggests that senior management must behave in a certain way to ensure compliance with this commitment. The actions to be measured are the following (Instituto Ethos, 2014, pp. 49-50):

- Address the topic in the company’s oral statements, documents, and policies.
- Not connive at discrimination.
- Guide decisions based on organizational identity.
- Rejecting homotransphobia in business and activities with stakeholders.
- Publicize commitments and practices.
- Building alliances with other organizations.

2. Promote equal opportunities and fair treatment to LGBT people: The policies and practices suggested by the Ethos Institute (2014) to promote equal
opportunities and fair treatment for LGBT people focus on guaranteeing job opportunities and fair treatment in the recruitment, selection and job training processes of companies towards their LGBT employees; and in reviewing or implementing benefit policies for LGBT people. The actions for their measurement are (Instituto Ethos, 2014, pp. 50-51):

- Policy on and practice of non-discrimination of LGBT persons in recruiting and selection.
- Set targets for the inclusion of transvestites and transgender persons.
- Revise recruiting and selection tools and procedures.
- Build capacity of recruiting and selection professionals.
- Revise the tools and procedures used in the assessment and identification of potentials.
- Include the topic of sexual orientation and gender identity in censuses and surveys.
- Carry out affirmative actions for the career development of transvestite and transgender professionals.
- Include a commitment to managers’ performance appraisal.
- Revise or implement policies for benefits to promote equality.
- Establish benefits and favourable conditions to the LGBT segment.

3. Promote a respectful, safe and healthy environment for LGBT people: The requirements to promote a respectful, safe and healthy environment for LGBT people in the company are the developing of relationships between team members, the existence of complaint routes, the planning and dissemination of policies, and the identification and dissemination of the good practices that help to develop this commitment (Instituto Ethos, 2014, p. 51).

- Build the capacity of managers and teams.
- Implement or improve complaint channels.
- Define non-discrimination policies and anti-discrimination measures.
- Define non-discrimination policies for people living with HIV/AIDS.
- Identify and encourage proper management and relationship practices.

4. Sensitize to and educate on LGBT rights: The inclusion of dates related to the LGBT community must be considered to sensitize and educate about LGBT rights and promote the issue in internal communication (Instituto Ethos, 2014, p. 52).

- Define a calendar for internal communication.
- Hold events.
- Addressing the topic in the company’s education agenda.
- Positively include the topic in internal communications.
5. Promote respect for LGBT rights in communication and marketing: The objective of the actions that the Ethos Institute (2014) suggests implementing is to avoid discriminatory content and the inclusion of positive messages of respect and appreciation to the LGBT community through communication and marketing (Instituto Ethos, 2014, p. 52).

- Formally monitor campaigns to avoid the risk of discrimination.
- Insert positive messages in the company’s communication and marketing.
- Devise or support campaigns that promote the rights of LGBT people and people living with HIV/AIDS.

4. Results

We applied the adapted model consisting of five commitments in the three cases presented. Next, we will describe the policies and practices we found.

4.1. The commitment of the CEO and executives to respect and promote LGBT rights

The commitment of the companies, studied through their practices, is evident. Table 1 shows the existence of the actions related to this commitment in the three case studies.

Table 1. The commitment of the CEO and executives to respect and promote LGBT rights

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>IBM</th>
<th>Atento</th>
<th>Scotiabank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Address the topic in the company’s oral statements, documents, and policies</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate diversity policies</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation of company leaders in internal and corporate LGBT initiatives</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alliances with organizations that promote the rights of LGBT people in the workplace</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: own elaboration.

- Address the topic in the company’s oral statements, documents, and policies: The case studies have the purpose of communicating their commitment to LGBT rights. In line with this objective, they use various mechanisms to address their stakeholders, with particular emphasis on their collaborators. The three companies have included the issue in business documents, but only senior management at IBM and Scotiabank have addressed the issue through oral statements.
- Corporate diversity policies: The three companies have a corporate policy of diversity or inclusion, which comes from their parent international company. In IBM and Scotiabank, policies are adapted to Peru. The corporate policy
governs Atento, and instead of considering the Peruvian context, international leaders decide what actions and initiatives to execute. From the interviews carried out, we identified that in Peru, IBM and Atento have been implementing these policies for years, while in Scotiabank, the adapted inclusion policy was prepared and presented just in December 2017.

- Participation of company leaders in internal and corporate LGBT initiatives: In IBM and Scotiabank, we found indications that demonstrate the participation of their leaders in LGBT initiatives promoted by various areas of the company. However, in Atento, no evidence was found. According to the Human Resources manager of IBM Peru, Ecuador, and Bolivia, the objective of the leaders’ participation is to sensitize, inform employees, and join allies.

- Alliances with organizations that promote the rights of LGBT people in the workplace: The three companies have demonstrated their willingness to build this type of alliance, albeit from a different approach. IBM and Scotiabank have been promoters of the recently formed Pride Connection network. Atento is not part of this network yet, but there has been coordination between them. However, Atento has an agreement with the MHOL, a Peruvian NGO that promotes the rights of LGBT people, to execute recruitment campaigns through it.

4.2. Promote equal opportunities and fair treatment for LGBT people

Through interviews, the review of employment portals, and business documents of the case studies, we deepened the research on the processes presented in Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>IBM</th>
<th>Atento</th>
<th>Scotiabank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Address the topic in the company’s oral statements, documents, and policies</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment and selection</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development process</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policies to promote equality</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: own elaboration.

- Recruitment and selection: Regarding recruitment, IBM and Atento have recruitment programs focused on bringing together the best candidates for the position, leaving aside their sexual orientation and gender identity. In the case of Atento, the Responsible Recruitment Program fosters diversity due to the support they provide to vulnerable groups or minorities to get formal employment, and they have made an agreement with MHOL for the next six years. However, Scotiabank does not give details in its internal and external documents about the recruitment process. Concerning the publications,
the three companies studied present features of the egalitarian and diverse environment of their companies, seeking to attract staff interested in that culture.

- Regarding selection, the three companies select the staff according to their talent. IBM focuses on talent and skills. Therefore, it leaves aside gender or sexual orientation when selecting people. However, they do not have an established quota of LGBT personnel that must work in the company. At the same time, IBM and Scotiabank offer courses for those responsible for human resources management, such as Unconscious Bias, which aims to prepare recruiters to avoid biases when evaluating candidates (IBMBLOGJOB, 2017). Scotiabank offers workshops on Unconscious Bias to leaders to help them know the biases they have on gender, sexuality, and religion. To contrast the information collected from those responsible for LGBT diversity and business documents, we consulted with collaborators, LGBT or not, if they identified any discrimination in the selection process. The interviewees mentioned they do not perceive discrimination, in this process, by sexual orientation or gender identity.

- Development process: The three study companies are concerned with the training of their staff for professional growth through direct training. In the three case studies, self-identified LGBT interviewed persons occupy senior and middle management positions. Besides, IBM seeks to empower managers as they are responsible for the professional growth of their team. Employees perceive that the company allows LGBT employees to have training without distinction, thanks to which they have reached high positions, which is evidenced by having two people who are openly LGBT, a lesbian Human Resources Manager, and a gay Human Resources Professional. In Scotiabank, although the employees interviewed commented that they have not identified LGBT staff in the executive team, the director of Integrated Marketing and Corporate Social Responsibility identified himself as gay during the interview. So, it follows that this company, regardless of their collaborators’ sexual orientation and gender identity, offers the opportunity for professional growth.

- Policies to promote equality: IBM Peru is the only company of the three that has these policies. On the other hand, Atento and Scotiabank have inclusive policies and practices, but they do not provide any exclusive benefits to their LGBT employees. In the case of IBM, they provide insurance for same-sex couples, life insurance, and maternity leave. IBM’s life insurance allows LGBT people to leave their goods, money, among others, to the people they want, within which they can find their same-sex partner. Likewise, the IBM Human Resources manager comments that it is feasible to provide maternity leave to same-sex couples who have children since there can be no differences compared to the couples that the law supports, although legally, it does not apply in Peru.
4.3. Healthy work environment

We evaluated the healthy work environment by using the three factors (WHO, 2010) shown in Table 3.

Table 3. Healthy work environment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>IBM</th>
<th>Atento</th>
<th>Scotiabank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social Environment</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complaint channels</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication of LGBT rights</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: own elaboration.

- Social Environment: IBM Peru has policies that address the phobia and encourage respect for LGBT people. However, despite these policies and the various practices, there are only two staff members who are openly LGBT. Atento showed more significant progress in this aspect, as mentioned in the responsibility report, and in the interviews, the environment was characterized as comfortable, diverse, equitable, and committed to promoting well-being and efficiency (Atento, 2015). Scotiabank’s code of conduct (2016) states that the company is against any act of discrimination concerning human rights.

- Complaint channels: The three case studies have up to three means of channelling complaints regarding acts of discrimination by people who suffer or detect them. These are communication with the area manager, a direct line, and anonymous communication. The manager or person in charge of the area should be the first to find out about the problem, because they could solve it in a faster and more direct way. The company trains them in these types of situations in order to respond in the most appropriate way possible. The second most popular means of communication is the Hotline, which is a telephone number to report acts of discrimination. This medium provides the ease of being available at all times and the possibility of contacting a person in the human resources area. Within IBM, there is a separate area that is responsible for independently managing these types of cases and providing psychological advice with specialists to those affected. Also, they do an investigation to prevent this type of activity from happening again. In Atento, this direct line is called “Atento a ti” or “Atento listen”. The interviewees commented that it is a telephone number to which all employees have access. In case they do not have a phone line, Atento facilitates the use of telephone booths in the campus, which have a direct line with “Atento a ti”; it communicates directly to human resources. In Scotiabank, the OMBUDS, an area responsible for receiving all types of complaints and solving them, manages this process (Scotiabank, 2014). Finally, the three companies offer...
the possibility of sending an anonymous email as a means to report a problem. This mechanism supports those who want more confidentiality. Also, to provide greater impartiality, these complaints are transferred to the parent company for assessment. Both management and employees recognize that this is one of the most efficient ways to report a discrimination problem.

- Communication of LGBT rights: There is evidence of the company’s respect for LGBT rights within their documents. First, in IBM’s internal regulations, there is an article that indicates people should not be discriminated against for reasons of sexual orientation (2016). Similarly, the Social Responsibility Report of Atento (2015) states the company does not discriminate in the case of sex, belonging to minorities or any other indicator of diversity. Finally, Scotiabank’s code of conduct (2016) makes it clear that discrimination based on sexual orientation is prohibited.

4.4. Sensitize and educate employees to respect the rights of LGBT people

The case studies carry out up to three actions to strengthen education and awareness on LGBT issues, as shown in Table 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>IBM</th>
<th>Atento</th>
<th>Scotiabank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training on the LGBT topic</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conversations on the LGBT issue</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Activities for the LGBT month</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: own elaboration.

- Training on the LGBT topic: In the three companies, the training is mandatory for managers and optional for other members of staff. However, each company has different models. In the same way, there are courses aimed at the families of workers for raising awareness and being able to address the issue. For example, IBM has a virtual platform with various courses to train their workers. In Atento, the training is not focused exclusively on managing LGBT diversity, but on raising awareness and educating about the issue of respect. The company believes the topic of diversity must be general, and there should not be specific training on LGBT topics as they would have a negative effect by stigmatizing something that is taken naturally within the organization. Finally, Scotiabank offers unconscious bias and leadership workshops. The objective is to train managers on day-to-day work issues so they can recognize their biases and allow their teams to develop a more empathic climate.

- Conversations: Within the case studies, only IBM has conversations on the LGBT issue because they invest more resources in this initiative. These
activities are for all collaborators, either LGBT or not. In IBM Peru, in order to meet the business objectives and talent requirements of the company, there are Business Resource Groups (BRG). The members of this group not only seek the well-being of LGBTs in their company but also in other companies. IBM has a BRG that focuses on all LGBT-related issues.

- Activities for the LGBT month: The three case studies perform activities on June 28 (LGBT World Pride Day), and, in some cases, throughout June, naming it the month of diversity. These celebrations have the objective of integrating LGBT people, allies, and people who are not educated on the subject. In this way, they seek to recognize the contribution that these minorities provide to the organization and raise awareness about the importance of educating themselves as part of the daily routine of the company. Furthermore, during the central LGBT pride day, the three companies showed their support for the LGBT community by changing the logo of their company on their social media, including the colours of the LGBT flag.

4.5. Promote respect for LGBT rights in communication and marketing

When analysing the communication and marketing of the companies, we identified they do not have the objective of promoting respect for LGBT rights in their clients. This is shown in Table 5.

Table 5. Promote respect for LGBT rights in communication and marketing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Actions</th>
<th>IBM</th>
<th>Atento</th>
<th>Scotiabank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Promotion of respect for LGBT rights in the communication of the company</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotion of respect for LGBT rights in company marketing</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: own elaboration.

- Promotion of respect for LGBT rights in the communication of the company: The three companies deal mainly with internal communications through various channels. However, in external communications, it was found that IBM and Atento included complimentary messages that promote the respect and appreciation of the LGBT community on the international LGBT pride day.
- Promotion of respect for LGBT rights in company marketing: We identified none in the case studies.

4.6. National culture and the value of respect

As mentioned, after applying the adapted diagnostic model, two variables emerged in the analysis. These were national culture and the value of respect as part of the organizational culture, influencing LGBT diversity management.
4.6.1. National culture

Hofstede et al. (2010) define national culture as “the collective programming of the mind that distinguishes members of a group or category of people from others” (p. 1). These authors established six dimensions of national culture that serve as a framework whose objective is to help evaluate culture. This must be considered because some factors that influence the start of LGBT diversity management are related to the culture of the country in which the company operates (Hidalgo & Campos, 2017). According to Withoos (2013), the dimensions of power distance and individualism are probably useful for research in the topic, as differences in sexuality are “probably expressed more verbally and loudly in individualistic cultures, as these focus on personal expression. The power distance dimension is concerned with how societies deal with inequality” (p. 15). The level of development of the diversity management of the companies studied in Peru is not as advanced as in other countries of the region and the world possibly due to this difference in its cultural context (Figure 2).

Figure 2 compares Hofstede’s six dimensions between Peru and the parent companies’ countries (Canada for Scotiabank, Spain for Atento, and the United States for IBM) (Hofstede, 2020). This comparison could explain some of the differences between the company’s policies and programs and the reality in their Peruvian subsidiaries.

In the first dimension, power distance, Peru has a high score of 64, the highest among the four countries (Hofstede, 2020). This dimension expresses the degree to which the less powerful members of a society accept and expect power to be distributed unevenly. The fundamental problem here is how society handles inequalities between people. The power distance dimension in Peru indicates that in this society, individuals are not equal. This could explain the attitude towards LGBT people, since discrimination is a characteristic of cultures with a high score in this dimension (Hofstede, 2018b). It could also hint why the three companies have much more advanced policies and programs in place in their home countries as compared to those in Peru.

According to the results of the measurement of cultural dimensions, Peruvian culture is collectivist, with a score of 16. This result is in line with most other Latin American countries and different to the parent companies’ countries, which punctuate as individualists (Hofstede, 2020). Collectivism represents a preference for a very unified framework in society in which individuals can expect their relatives or members of a particular group to take care of them in exchange for unquestionable loyalty (Hofstede, 2018b).

The third dimension, masculinity, is related to trends, but it is not an identifiable reality in individuals. The feminine side implies a preference for cooperation, modesty, care for the weak, and quality of life (Hofstede, 2018b). By having a low score (42), Peruvian society is considered feminine because it prefers human contact and family over recognition or wealth (Hofstede, 2020). It is interesting to see that there are no significant differences between the four countries in this dimension.

The dimension with the highest score in Peru is that of uncertainty avoidance (87) (Hofstede, 2020). This dimension expresses the degree to which members of a society feel uncomfortable with uncertainty and ambiguity. Countries that exhibit a strong aversion to uncertainty maintain rigid codes of belief and behaviour and are intolerant of heterodox...
behaviour and ideas (Hofstede, 2018b). For this investigation, it is necessary to highlight this dimension because one of the factors that raise its score is the repression of minorities, such as LGBT people. In Peru, this population lives in a context of exclusion and discrimination, being victims of physical and verbal aggressions, murders, among others, and they do not have a developed national regulatory framework that ensures their protection (Defensoría del Pueblo, 2016; Red Peruana de Trans, Lesbianas, Gays y Bisexuales & Centro de Promoción y Defensa de los Derechos Sexuales y Reproductivos, 2016). This high score is shared with Spain; however, both Canada and the United States have much lower scores. Nevertheless, the three case studies have more progressive policies and practices towards people with disabilities and women, who are recognized as vulnerable groups in our society and have a more developed regulatory framework for protection than that of LGBTs. The three case studies have developed various areas of diversity management before implementing LGBT diversity management at their headquarters in Peru. For example, IBM manages a total of 13 types of diversity in 45 countries (IBM, 2016) and only four in Peru: gender diversity, culture, people with disabilities, and LGBT. When we compared the studied companies, we found a strong relationship between the previously implemented initiatives and the context in which they find themselves.

In the long-term orientation dimension, Peru scores low (25), which may mean that Peruvian culture has short-term normative guidance. In other words, Peruvians prefer to maintain traditions and care to establish the absolute “truth” (Hofstede, 2018a). The most significant difference in this dimension is with Spain, but the other two countries show similar results. Peru’s case shows a more traditional and conservative society not open to sexual diversity and the LGBT community.

Finally, indulgence represents a culture that is lenient when it allows the relatively free gratification of raw and natural human impulses related to enjoying life and having fun. Peru has an average score, below that of Canada and the United States (Hofstede, 2018b, 2020).

**Figure 2. Country comparison**

![Figure 2. Country comparison](image-url)

Source: Hofstede (2020).
4.6.2. Respect as a shared value in the case studies

When comparing the organizational values of the three companies, we noticed they share the value of respect in relationships with employees. They intend these values, together with the principles, to serve as a guide for the behaviour of their workers. Currently, IBM values are three: dedication to the success of each client, innovation that matters for their company and the world, and trust and personal responsibility in all relationships. These values are visible through aspects such as inclusive internal communication, photo checks and merchandising (backpacks, holsters) with colours alluding to LGBT pride, and observing that its leadership positions the topic in internal and external communication.

Atento’s values are commitment, passion, integrity, and trust. The latter, according to their Sustainability Report (Atento, 2015), refers to guaranteeing trust, transparency, and respect in relations with all its stakeholders (customers, employees, suppliers, society, and shareholders). In the case of Atento, the interviewees affirmed that the value of respect promotes a culture where employees are encouraged, in general, to present themselves as they are. In this sense, whatever the gender, gender identity or sexual orientation of the collaborator, they can be who they are. Atento’s orientation for diversity was born with the company. It transmits these values through visible aspects such as inclusive internal communication; the large, juvenile, inclusive labour campus; and recreational activities such as championships and talent competitions where the same collaborators even choose transgender people as sponsors of some teams.

Finally, Scotiabank’s values are four: respect, integrity, passion, and responsibility. The basis of Scotiabank’s culture is respect and meritocracy. Employees perceive that to enter or ascend in the company, sexual orientation is no impediment or argument against; rather, it depends on the person’s ability to perform well. A Scotiabank collaborator for 22 years commented on how the bank’s culture has evolved from the time it was Banco de Lima to when it became Scotiabank, deploying the culture of the Canadian bank at the Lima branch.

5. Conclusions

This paper is a pioneer in the study of LGBT diversity management in Peru and allows us to know how the leading companies in diversity are handling the issue, identifying standards applicable to the Peruvian context. Therefore, we recommend that those companies interested in managing LGBT diversity in this country use this adapted Ethos Institute diagnostic model to identify the key aspects they should develop. We also encourage them to take this list of good practices from leading companies in diversity management in Peru as a reference.

---

13 It refers to the identities, functions, and socially constructed attributes of women and men, and the social and cultural meaning attributed to these biological differences (CIDH, n.d.).
14 Internal and individual experience of gender, which may or may not correspond to the sex assigned at the time of birth, including the personal experience of the body and other gender expressions such as clothing, manner of speaking, and manners (Principios de Yogykarta, 2007).
15 The capacity of each person to feel a deep emotional, affective and sexual attraction for people of a gender different from their own, or of the same gender, or more than one gender, as well as the ability to maintain intimate and sexual relationships with these people.
In principle, we were able to identify that the diagnostic model for LGBT diversity management proposed by the Ethos Institute of Brazil is very useful for diagnosing the level of development of this management in companies. However, experts on the subject adapted this model to the Peruvian environment, because, even if they are both South American countries, they do not share the same context concerning LGBT people. The experts interviewed did not consider evaluating five of the variables of the diagnostic model, as it was likely that we would not find evidence of them in the companies studied. This conclusion demonstrates the long way companies in Peru still need to work to manage LGBT diversity appropriately.

We found that this model did not contemplate one aspect that literature and case studies consider essential when addressing the management of sexual diversity in companies: the role of national culture. The national culture has been considered by those responsible for managing LGBT diversity in the case studies as a limiting factor that influences the level of progress on the issue in companies. The high uncertainty avoidance in Peruvian culture could be the reason why the development and implementation of these policies are limited. Therefore, IBM and Scotiabank have set out as short-term objectives to sensitize employees and develop allies who sympathize with this type of diversity, while Atento has set itself the goal of maintaining and continuing to promote diversity in the company. It is fundamental for international management to understand the impact of national culture in the management of a company.

Regarding the application of the model adapted from the Ethos Institute to the case studies, we can conclude that, in the first place, the practices implemented by the case studies are backed by a sustainable strategy because they commit senior management to them. Second, the three studied companies are committed to promoting equal opportunities and fair treatment for LGBT people through policies and practices in the processes of recruitment, selection, professional development, and benefits to promote equality. Third, the companies try to ensure a respectful, safe, and healthy environment through an adequate social environment among employees, ensuring ways of claiming to respond to the needs of the workers, and the definition and dissemination of company policies. Finally, when analysing the communication and marketing of the company, we identified that the companies do not have the objective of promoting respect for LGBT rights with their clients yet. Their focus is on achieving this inside the company first, although specific initiatives in external communication by IBM and Atento contribute to raising the level of respect for this community.

On the other hand, it is interesting to find that the three companies are international, which shows more significant interest in this type of company for diversity management. As mentioned before, the parent company gives them the guidelines by which they should manage and the minimum notions that they must provide to all their stakeholders.

Another important finding to highlight is that although the three companies develop adequate management of LGBT diversity and are leaders in the subject in the country, it has not been possible to identify several openly LGBT people within them. For example, we only mapped two LGBT collaborators in IBM Peru.
Atento, unlike the other two case studies, does not aim to develop policies and practices focused on LGBT people, since this company believes in providing equal treatment to all its workers without making differences for any diversity.

We recognize that the present study has some limitations in the number of case studies, bibliographic sources and LGBT workers. First, it only has three case studies to assess the management of LGBT diversity in Peru, because the number of companies that develop this management in this country is low. In the second place, there was no access to several investigations on the management of LGBT diversity in Latin American countries, nor in Peru, since there are no studies on the subject from the workplace. This fact was confirmed by the experts interviewed. Finally, a higher number of LGBT collaborators could not be accessed because the case studies do not monitor or identify the official number of LGBT collaborators within their company. In the same way, many LGBT workers do not share their sexual orientation openly; therefore, to access them, we had to turn to references from acquaintances.

Through this research, we confirm that the workforce is increasingly diverse, and it is important for companies to include this diversity as it is beneficial for results. The case studies recognize the importance of their human resources, so inclusion is a necessity. Even more, they are committed to develop LGBT diversity management to provide a better working environment for all their workers. Not only have they focused on carrying out this management within the company, but they have participated in external activities as well. They have published posts on their social networks that allow society to perceive the support, respect, and commitment they provide to LGBT people, a population in a vulnerable situation in Peru.

For future research, the present study provides direction to develop a diagnostic model for LGBT diversity management applicable to companies with operations in Peru. Also, action plans could be established for companies to implement policies and practices related to the 10 Business Commitments for the promotion of LGBT rights according to the Ethos Institute of Brazil. We believe future research could be carried out on the five commitments that we did not evaluate. These are:

- Encourage and support the creation of LGBT affinity groups.
- Promote respect for LGBT rights in planning products, services, and customer service.
- Promote professional development actions for people of the LGBT segment.
- Promote economic and social development of LGBT people in the value chain.
- Promote and support actions aimed at LGBT rights in the community.
bibliografía

**Apoyo & Asociados**

2017  

**Alarcon, D., Castillo, C., & Gastelú, I.**

2018  

**Atento**

n.d.  

**Atento**

2015  

**Atento**

2016  

**Aurini, J.D., Heath, M., & Howells, S.**

2016  
The How To of Qualitative Research: Strategies for Executing High Quality Projects. Sage.

**Badgett, M.L., Nezhad, S., Waaldijk, C., & Meulen, R.Y.**

2014  

**Bailinson, P., Decherd, W., Ellsworth, D., & Guttmann, M.**

2020  

**Carcedo Cabañas, A., Chaves Groh, M.J., Lexartza Artza, L., & Sánchez Mora, A.**

2016  

**Comisión Interamericana de Derechos Humanos (CIDH)**

n.d.  
Estudio sobre OS, IG y EG. Términos y estándares. https://www.oas.org/es/cidh/lgtbi/docs/CIDH.%20Estudio%20sobre%20OS,%20GI%20y%20EG.%20T%C3%A9rminos%20y%20est%C3%A1ndares.doc

**Dwyer, M.**

2017, November 21  

**El Comercio**

2017, June 28  
Eulich, W.

Forbes, R.

Frost & Sullivan

Frostación CEPAIM

Gilbert, J.A., Stead, B.A., & Ivancevich, J.M.

Given, L.M. (Ed.)
2008 *The Sage encyclopedia of qualitative research methods*. SAGE.

**bibliografía**

Gómez, S.

**Great Place To Work (GPTW)**

Hernandez, R., Fernandez, C., & Baptista, P.

Hidalgo, P., & Campos, E.

Hofstede, G., Hofstede, G.J., & Minkov, M.

Hofstede, G.

Hofstede, G.

Hofstede, G.
2020 *Country Comparisons (Canada, Peru, Spain, United States)*. https://www.hofstede-insights.com/country-comparison/canada,peru,spain,the-usa/
bibliografía

**Human Rights Campaign**

*CORPORATE EQUALITY INDEX 2018*

**Hunt, V., Layton, D., & Prince, S.**

2015

**IBM**

n.d.

**IBM**

n.d.
¿Qué puedes hacer con el poder de IBM? https://www-05.ibm.com/employment/pe-es/

**IBM**

2013
Reglamento Interno de Trabajo. Perú.

**IBM**

2016

**IBMJOBSBLOG**

2016

**IBM**

2018

**Instituto Ethos**

2014

**Instituto Ethos**

2016
Instituto Ethos. https://www3.ethos.org.br

**Instituto Europeo para la Gestión de la Diversidad (IEGD)**

2016
Gestión inclusión de la diversidad. https://www.iegd.org/home/politicas-de-gestion-inclusion-diversidad

**Jack, E.P., & Raturi, A.S.**

2006

**Jurado Nacional de Elecciones**

2016

**Köllen, T.**

2016

**Kreitner, R., & Knicki, A.**

2001

**Marquis, J., Lim, N., Scott, L., Harrell, M., & Kavanagh, J.**

2008
bibliografía


Mucchielli, A.

O’Mahoney, M.

Oficina Internacional de Trabajo

Organización Internacional del Trabajo (OIT)

Ozeren, E.

Peña, K.

Porret, G.M.

Principios de Yogykarta
2007 Principios sobre la aplicación de la legislación internacional de derechos humanos en relación con la orientación sexual e identidad de género. https://www.refworld.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/rwmain/opendocpdf.pdf?redoc=y&docid=48244e9f2

Red Empresarial por la Diversidad e Inclusión LGBTI

Red Peruana de Trans, Lesbianas, Gays y Bisexuales, & Centro de Promoción y Defensa de los Derechos Sexuales y Reproductivos

Schein, E.H.
2010 Organizational culture and leadership (vol. 2). San Francisco, CA: John Wiley & Sons.
bibliography

Saunders, M., Lewis, P., & Thornhill, A. 2009
Research Methods for Business Students. Prentice Hall.

Scotiabank
2014

Scotiabank
2016

SMV
2017

Stake, R.E.
2000
Case Studies. In Denzin N.K and Lincoln Y.S. (Eds.), Handbook of Qualitative Research (pp. 435-454). SAGE.

Turek, D.
2017

Withoos, M.
2013

World Health Organization (WHO)
2010
Entornos Laborales Saludables: Fundamentos y Modelos de la OMS Contextualización, Prácticas y Literatura de Apoyo. WHO. http://www.who.int/occupational_health/evelyn_hwp_spanish.pdf

Yin., R.
2018
Case Study Research and Applications: Design and Methods. SAGE.